

Poland Economics View

What does minimum wage mean for inflation?

- In this note we present estimates of the impact of a higher minimum wage for overall wage growth and inflation in Poland.
- We try to take into account a likely increase in incidence of non-compliance with minimum wage regulation as well as widespread use of 'envelope payments' among small sized companies.
- We estimate that after the 33% increase in minimum wage in 2020 overall wage growth in the enterprise sector could reach 9.6% (versus 6.5% in our baseline scenario).
- Due to higher wage growth we see a risk that the decline in inflation in 2020 and 2021 is less visible and the inflation path is 0.3-0.4% points higher compared to previous estimates.
- We don't expect any change in interest rates, at least for now.

Piotr Kalisz, CFA
+48-22-692-9633
piotr.kalisz@citi.com

Cezary Chrapek
+48-22-692-9421
cezary.chrapek@citi.com

Impact of higher minimum wage

The government's new plan to increase the statutory minimum wage by 33% in 2020 and by a total 77% within four years could potentially be a significant shock for the economy. Given the unprecedented (at least for Polish standards) scale of this change, the economic consequences are difficult to gauge. The exact impact of a higher minimum wage will depend on several factors, including: a) how many employees are affected by the change, b) the extent of non-compliance with the new regulation and c) arrangements regarding remuneration of employees.

Who will be affected?

The share of employees earning a minimum wage has been relatively stable in recent years and hovered around 13%. However, since the planned minimum wage increase is large, the group of workers affected by the regulation will be significantly larger as it will include also those earning at least 33% more than the minimum rate. Based on latest available wage distribution data¹ we estimate that approximately one quarter of all employees in the private sector will be affected in 2020 and more than 30% could be affected by 2023. This also increases the risk that changes in the statutory wage will boost wage demands of workers who fall in relatively narrow brackets between the new minimum and the median. The impact should be disproportionately felt in smaller cities and villages as well as the Eastern part of Poland, where wage levels are significantly lower than in big cities.

Risk of non-compliance

Using wage distribution data it is possible to calculate an approximate impact of the minimum wage on overall wage increases in the private sector. However, the actual impact needs to take into account also potential instances of non-compliance by firms affected by the regulation. The higher the minimum wage the more firms will be tempted to violate minimum wage laws. Empirical research shows the incidence of violations is relatively low in Poland, at least when compared to other EM countries, reaching 4-5% among full-time workers². However, there seems to be a correlation between violation incidence and the minimum-to-average-wage ratio. As the latter is expected to rise in the coming years from ~0.4 towards 0.6, it makes sense to expect that non-compliance will rise as well. Based on relations for CEE economies reported by Goraus and Lewandowski (2016) we assume the share of workers earning below the minimum levels in Poland will rise by half - from 4% to 6%.

All in all, taking into account a potential increase in the number of non-complying firms, we estimate that after the 33% increase in minimum wage in 2020 overall wage growth in the enterprise sector could reach 9.6% (versus 6.5% in our baseline scenario). This implies an approximately 11% multiplier for minimum wage changes, which is comparable with results reported by the IMF³. Since the government is planning to continue minimum wage increases after 2020 (by another 33% until 2023), the period of higher wage growth is likely to last longer, and we believe the risks are on the side of more significant increases.

¹ The latest wage distribution data are for October 2016. We indexed the income brackets with average wage growth for past three years and used such a corrected distribution for our purpose.

² See for example: Goraus, Lewandowski, „Minimum wage violation in Central and Eastern Europe”, IBS Working Paper 03/2016.

³ “Cross Country Report on Minimum Wages”, IMF Selected Issues 16/151, June 2016.

Inflation impact

From the point of view of inflation pressures, what matters is not only the reported wage growth but also the actual impact on remuneration of employees. This is where the exact form of remuneration arrangements matters a lot. Studies suggest that a significant share of small sized companies may use 'envelope payments' which assumes that employees officially receive the minimum wage while the remaining part of remuneration is paid 'under the table' in cash. This means that in the case of a minimum wage increase, the composition of remuneration could change, while the actual income of workers (and wage costs of companies) remains the same. For example in Hungary this was one of the results of minimum wage increases, leading to higher reported wages and tax revenues but had less impact on inflation and competitiveness.

The 'envelope payment' phenomenon can affect a large number of firms. Analysis from 2009 showed the share of employees receiving envelope wages in Poland was at 11% (vs. for example 3% in Czech Republic and 23% in Romania). Furthermore employees reporting this fact were receiving approximately half of gross income in 'envelope payments'⁴. For our calculations we assume that 10% of employees are affected by this practice, all of them at bottom of the income distribution. With this in mind we estimate that after the 2020 minimum wage adjustment the overall increase in gross wages could reach 9% in the private sector.

Strong wage growth, especially among workers with high propensity to spend, is likely to boost consumer demand. Coupled with increased pension and child benefit transfers, this may help maintain real consumption growth around 4% YoY. The extent to which firms will be able to pass higher costs to prices will depend on the sector. We assume firms in the tradeable sector who face external competition will keep prices largely unchanged and will accept lower profits or will try to move towards less labour intensive processes, possibly by investing more. However, in the case of services the price effect may be more visible. Our calculations suggest that a 1% increase in wages usually increases services inflation by around 0.3% points but this estimate covers periods of booms and slowdowns and we expect this time – due to high capacity utilization, narrow margins and low unemployment - the actual impact could be bigger.

With this in mind we think the wage shock after the minimum wage increase in 2020 could increase services prices by around 1 percentage point, which would add 0.3-0.4 to the overall consumer price index. An additional boost would be recorded when the second wave of minimum wage hikes is delivered in 2021-2023.

Our base case without minimum wage hikes assumes the CPI would reach 4% in early 2020 and would decline gradually thereafter, reaching 2.5-3% by the end of that year. Now, with higher wage growth there is a risk the decline in inflation in 2020 will be less visible and the inflation path will be 0.3-0.4% points higher compared to previous estimates. It is possible the CPI will stay above the central bank's target throughout both 2020-2021, though the exact shape of the CPI path will depend on the timing of the minimum wage increase.

⁴ Colin C. Williams, „The Commonality of Envelope Wages in Eastern European Economies”, *Eastern European Economics*, vol. 47, no. 2, March-April 2009.

Monetary policy implications

These may be challenging times for the Monetary Policy Council. On the one hand, global growth continues to disappoint, and major central banks have already moved towards policy easing. On the other hand, consumption growth in Poland may stay higher than previously expected, while inflation is likely to deviate upwards from previous projections. Based on MPC decisions so far we assume the Council will prefer to stick to its neutral/dovish stance and may downplay potential inflation risks. Therefore we maintain our scenario which assumes stable rates throughout 2019 and 2020. However, the behavior of the MPC in the following years is now much more uncertain and will depend on how exactly inflation evolves.

Economics Research

Piotr Kalisz, CFA

Chief Economist

+48 (22) 692-9633

piotr.kalisz@citi.com

Cezary Chrapek

Economist

+48 (22) 692-9421

cezary.chrapek@citi.com

Citi Handlowy

Senatorska 16

00-923 Warszawa

Polska

Fax: +48 22-657-76-80

This document has only been prepared by Bank Handlowy w Warszawie S.A. for information purposes and is not an inducement to enter into any transaction involving any financial instruments. This document is not an investment or financial analysis or any other general recommendation concerning transactions in financial instruments referred to in Article 69(4).6 of the Act of 29 July 2005 on trade in financial instruments.. This document doesn't constitute „information recommending or suggesting an investment strategy” nor an „investment recommendation” as defined in European Parliament Regulation and the Council of EU No 596/2014 on market abuse (April 16th 2014). This material is not an investment research or a marketing communication within the meaning of article 36 of the Commission Delegated Regulation (EU) 2017/565 of 25 April 2016 supplementing Directive 2014/65/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council as regards organisational requirements and operating conditions for investment firms and defined terms for the purposes of that Directive.

All presented information is based on sources commonly regarded as reliable. The Bank has made every effort to prepare the presented document with the reliability, completeness and due diligence, however, Bank will not assume any responsibility for the accuracy and completeness of any information in this document, including when the underlying information on which the report was prepared was not complete. Any terms and conditions presented in this document are only for discussion and may change. All opinions and forecasts contained in this document constitute an assessment for the date of publication and may be subject to change without notice.

It is exclusively Client responsibility to make the final decision whether or not to enter into a transaction and for the final result of investment decision taken based on information contained in this material. The Bank can conclude reverse hedging transactions to transactions entered by the Client, that may, but don't need to have, a negative effect on the market price of a financial instrument, interest rate, index or other market parameter underlying the transactions. The information contained in this publication which refers to past listings or performance of investments in a given instrument, financial index or indicator does not constitute a guarantee that the listings or performance of investments in the same instrument, index or indicator will follow the same or even a comparable trend in the future. Any presented forecasts are based on specific assumptions, analyses and models used by Bank, therefore, actual quotations and the results of investment in the presented instruments, indices or financial indicators may significantly differ from the projected value.

The Bank or any other subsidiary of Citigroup Inc. may occur to be an issuer or creator for identical or similar to those described in this document financial instruments. Bank (or other entity of the Group of Citi or its directors, specialists and other employees) may be involved in both buying and selling instruments described herein. The Bank does not act as an advisor or a broker in financial instruments described in this market comments. The Bank certifies that the information contained in the presented document accurately reflect his own opinions and that it has not received any remuneration from issuers or creators of instruments, either directly or indirectly, for such opinions. The Bank has in place appropriate procedures and solutions to manage properly conflicts of interest.

The Bank has not developed this market commentary based on the individual situation of the customer and not evaluated its adequacy for a Client with regard to any financial instrument described in this market comments, even if the Bank was in a possession of information as to the adequacy of certain financial instruments, investment strategy, etc. The Bank reserves the right to discontinue the distribution of market comments to selected or all customers.

Copying and distributing this document, in part or in whole, is only authorized upon the prior written consent of the Bank, except where the disclosure of this document is mandatory in legal or administrative proceedings. The activities of the Bank are supervised by the Polish Financial Supervision Authority (Komisja Nadzoru Finansowego). This document has been prepared for information purposes only and does not constitute a sale offer within the meaning of Article 66 of the Polish Civil Code and imposes no obligation to enter into any transaction. Citi and Citi Handlowy are registered trademarks of Citigroup Inc., used under license. Citigroup Inc. and its subsidiaries have also the rights to certain other trademarks used in this document.

Bank Handlowy w Warszawie with its registered office in Warsaw at ul. Senatorska 16, 00-923 Warszawa, entered in the Register of Entrepreneurs of the National Court Register by the District Court for the capital city of Warsaw in Warsaw, 12th Commercial Department of the National Court Register, under KRS No. 000 000 1538, NIP 526-030-02-91; the share capital is PLN 522,638,400, fully paid-up.